

Conscience and Catholicism

*Rights, Responsibilities,
and Institutional Responses*

Edited by

DAVID E. DECOSSE AND KRISTIN E. HEYER

ORBIS  BOOKS
Maryknoll, New York 10545

Founded in 1970, Orbis Books endeavors to publish works that enlighten the mind, nourish the spirit, and challenge the conscience. The publishing arm of the Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers, Orbis seeks to explore the global dimensions of the Christian faith and mission, to invite dialogue with diverse cultures and religious traditions, and to serve the cause of reconciliation and peace. The books published reflect the views of their authors and do not represent the official position of the Maryknoll Society. To learn more about Maryknoll and Orbis Books, please visit our website at www.maryknollsociety.org.

Copyright © 2015 President and Board of Trustees of Santa Clara College.

Published by Orbis Books, Maryknoll, New York 10545-0302.

Manufactured in the United States of America.

Manuscript editing and typesetting by Joan Weber Laflamme.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

Queries regarding rights and permissions should be addressed to: Orbis Books, P.O. Box 302, Maryknoll, New York 10545-0302.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Conscience and Catholicism : rights, responsibilities, and institutional responses / edited by David E. DeCosse and Kristin E. Heyer

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-62698-144-7 (pbk.)

1. Conscience—Religious aspects—Catholic Church—Congresses. 2. Christian ethics—Catholic authors—Congresses. 3. Catholic Church—Doctrines—Congresses. I. DeCosse, David E., editor.

BJ1278.C66C655 2015

241'1088282—dc23

2015009612

Contents

Acknowledgments	xiii
Introduction	
DAVID E. DECOSSE AND KRISTIN E. HEYER	xv
1. To Follow and to Form over Time	
<i>A Phenomenology of Conscience</i>	
JAMES F. KEENAN, S.J.	1
The Weak, Sick, Conforming Conscience of the Laity of the First Fifty Years	1
The European Repudiation of the Manuals and Their Turn to Conscience	5
The American Rejection of the European Turn to Conscience	8
Conscience Today	12
An Application	13
2. Newman and the Problem of Conscience in Relation to Papal Infallibility	
JOHN R. QUINN	17
3. Three Modes of the Embodiment of Conscience	
OSAMU TAKEUCHI, S.J.	27
Being a Good Person: Ryōshin or Conscience	28
Kokoro or Heart/Mind	29
Confucianism: Virtue Ethics	29
Making a Good Community: Wa	31
<i>Seventeen Articles of the Constitution</i>	32
Harmony and the Common Good	33
Conscience and the Common Good	34
Called to Be a Good and Holy Person: Conscience as Sanctuary	36

Ryōshin and Conscience: Relationship, Transcendence, and Embodiment	37
Conclusion	38
4. Conscience, Catholicism, and the New Science of Morality	
STEPHEN J. POPE	39
The New Science of Morality	39
Mapping Conscience in Catholicism	43
Applications to Conscience in Catholicism	49
Conclusion	52
5. Conscience Formation and the Challenge of Unconscious Racial Bias	
BRYAN N. MASSINGALE	53
Racism Today: A “Cultured Indifference”	56
“Unconscious” Racial Bias	58
Cultural Conditioning and “Racially Selective Sympathy”	59
The Relevance for Conscience Formation	61
Toward a New Direction in Conscience Formation: Cross-Racial Solidarity	64
6. Joan of Arc, Holy Resistance, and Conscience Formation in the Face of Social Sin	
LISA FULLAM	69
Introduction	69
Joan of Arc	72
Method	75
The Unity of the Virtues	76
General Cardinal Virtues	77
Conscience Formation	79
Conclusion	82
7. Marriage Equality, Conscience, and the Catholic Tradition	
LINDA HOGAN	83
Conscience and Context: The Context of Conscience	85
Moral Truth and the Formation of Conscience in the Post–Vatican II Church	87
Situated Moral Knowledge and the Personalist Conscience	89
Claims in Conflict within the Church: Marriage Equality	93

8. Marriage Equality in Argentina

Catholicism, Democracy, and the Situated Conscience

EMILCE CUDA	97
Introduction	97
Case Introduction: Process and Promulgation of the Egalitarian Marriage Law in Argentina as an Example of the Situated Catholic Moral Conscience	98
Political and Philosophical Framework: Conscience as an Empty Signifier of Social Antagonism	101
Theological Framework: God’s War, Eschatology, and Social Inequality	103
Toward the Unity-in-Difference of the Situated Conscience: Antagonism and Agonism in the Construction of Popular Identities	106
Conclusion	109

9. Public Officers as Conscientious Objectors

Consequences to Reproductive Health in the Philippines

ERIC MARCELO O. GENILO, S.J.	111
A Case Study	112
Conscientious Objection in the Responsible Parenthood and Reproductive Health Act	115
Conscientious Objection and the Exercise of Political Authority	116
Respecting Freedom of Conscience and Freedom of Religion	117
Interpreting the Common Good	119
The Public Officer’s Conscience and the Implementation of the Law	121
Epilogue	125

10. Conscience, the Locus of our Being, and Anti-Conversion Laws in India

EUGINE RODRIGUES, B.S.	127
Introduction	127
Enactment of Anti-Conversion Laws in India	128
The Universal Declaration of Human Rights on Freedom of Conscience: A Basis for the Indian Constitution	130
Anti-Conversion Laws and Catholic Theological and Conciliar Arguments for Freedom of Conscience	131
Anti-Conversion Laws and the Catholic Church in India	136

11. From Catholic Healthcare West to Dignity Health	
<i>Conflicts of Conscience in American Catholic Health Care</i>	
CAROL BAYLEY	139
Two Cases	141
Healthcare and the Limits of Magisterial Authority:	
Conscience within the Catholic Church	141
Healthcare and the Limits of Magisterial Authority:	
Conscience, Church, and the Pluralist World	145
CHW Is Dissolved	147
Conclusion	150
12. “To Pardon What Conscience Dreads”	
<i>Navigating the Contours of Precepts and the Contexts of Life</i>	
AGBONKHIANMEGHE E. OROBATOR, S.J.	153
Introduction	153
The Background and the Context	154
“‘This We Teach’”: HIV/AIDS and the Rhetoric of	
Conscience	155
Understanding What Conscience Dreads	157
“‘This We Do’”: Complexity of Conscience Formation	160
Conclusion	165
13. Can an Organization Have a Conscience?	
<i>Contributions from Social Science to Catholic Social Thought</i>	
DANIEL K. FINN	167
Introduction	167
Options within Sociology	169
What Is Emergence?	171
What Are Social Structures and How Do They Influence	
Human Action?	172
Critical Realism and Catholic Social Thought	174
How Do Social Structures Change?	175
Organizations with a Conscience?	178
Conclusion	180
14. The Wisdom of Serpents	
<i>Conscience, Power, and Politics in the Abortion Controversy</i>	
WILLIAM R. O’NEILL, S.J.	183
Re-enchanting the Public Sphere?	183
Three Political Maxims	187
The Politics of Abortion	192

A Brief Excursus on “Intrinsic Evil” 196
Conclusion 197

**Appendix: Conscience, Democracy, and the Service of God in the
“Tangle of the Mind”**

DAVID E. DECOSSE 199

Contributors 207

Index 211