

# **AFTER THE SMOKE CLEARS**

The Just War Tradition  
and Post War Justice

Mark J. Allman & Tobias L. Winright

ORBIS  BOOKS  
Maryknoll, New York 10545

Founded in 1970, Orbis Books endeavors to publish works that enlighten the mind, nourish the spirit, and challenge the conscience. The publishing arm of the Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers, Orbis seeks to explore the global dimensions of the Christian faith and mission, to invite dialogue with diverse cultures and religious traditions, and to serve the cause of reconciliation and peace. The books published reflect the views of their authors and do not represent the official position of the Maryknoll Society. To learn more about Maryknoll and Orbis Books, please visit our website at [www.maryknollsociety.org](http://www.maryknollsociety.org).

---

Copyright © 2010 by Mark J. Allman and Tobias L. Winright.

Published by Orbis Books, Maryknoll, New York 10545-0302.  
Manufactured in the United States of America.

Unless otherwise stated, all scripture quotes are taken from the New Revised Standard Version of the Bible, copyright © 1946, 1952, 1971, 1989, by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the USA.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

Queries regarding rights and permissions should be addressed to: Orbis Books, P.O. Box 302, Maryknoll, New York 10545-0302.

---

### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Allman, Mark.

After the smoke clears : the just war tradition and post war justice /

Mark J. Allman and Tobias L. Winright.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-57075-859-1 (pbk.)

1. Just war doctrine. 2. Peace-building—Religious aspects—Catholic Church. I. Winright, Tobias L. II. Title.

BX1795.W37A45 2010

261.8'73—dc22

2010010777

# CONTENTS

|  |    |
|--|----|
| Acknowledgments  | ix |
| Introduction: Just War and Just Peace  | 1  |
| Hard Lessons from Afghanistan and Iraq   | 2  |
| Why Should Christians Care?  | 3  |
| Called to Be Peacemakers: Pacifism and Just War                                | 6  |
| Being Honest about Just War Thinking   | 8  |
| <i>Jus ante Bellum, Jus ad Bellum, Jus in Bello,</i><br><i>Jus post Bellum</i> | 9  |
| The Structure of the Argument  | 13 |
| An Explanation of Terms Used   | 16 |

## PART 1

### THE JUST WAR THEORY AND *JUS POST BELLUM*

|  |    |
|--|----|
| 1. The Just War Tradition: Its History, Categories,<br>and Flaws     | 21 |
| Historical Developments  | 22 |
| ANCIENT GREEK AND ROMAN THOUGHT                                      | 22 |
| FROM PACIFISM TO JUST WAR: JUST WAR IN THE EARLY<br>CHRISTIAN CHURCH | 24 |
| AMBROSE, AUGUSTINE, AND GRATIAN                                      | 27 |
| THE EARLY MEDIEVAL PERIOD  | 31 |
| THOMAS AQUINAS   | 32 |
| SECULARIZING JUST WAR THOUGHT: VITORIA, SUAREZ,<br>AND GROTIUS       | 33 |
| THE PERIOD AFTER THE WORLD WARS                                      | 36 |
| Overview of the Traditional Categories                               | 37 |
| <i>JUS AD BELLUM</i> —BEFORE WAR                                     | 38 |

**vi CONTENTS**

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>JUS IN BELLO</i> —JUSTICE DURING WAR                                   | 44        |
| Weaknesses and Strengths of the Just War Tradition                        | 49        |
| <b>2. <i>Jus Post Bellum</i>: An Emerging Category</b>                    | <b>57</b> |
| Nascent Elements of <i>Jus Post Bellum</i><br>in the Tradition            | 58        |
| THE ANCIENT WORLD   | 58        |
| THE CHRISTIAN TRADITION   | 62        |
| THE WORK OF IMMANUEL KANT   | 64        |
| Philosophy, Political Science, International Law,<br>and Military Science | 66        |
| BRIAN OREND   | 67        |
| GARY J. BASS  | 68        |
| DOUG MCCREADY   | 71        |
| MARK EVANS  | 72        |
| A Theological Perspective   | 74        |
| Conclusion  | 79        |

**PART 2**  
**FOUR *JUS POST BELLUM* CRITERIA**

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>3. The Just Cause Principle</b>                                  | <b>85</b>  |
| <i>Jus Post Bellum</i> and the Tradition                            | 85         |
| ACCOUNTABILITY  | 87         |
| A MEANS OF RESTRAINT  | 88         |
| PROPORTIONALITY   | 89         |
| PRACTICAL IMPLICATIONS  | 89         |
| <i>Jus Post Bellum</i> : Can You Get Good Fruit from<br>a Bad Tree? | 90         |
| OREND'S POSITION ON JUST CAUSE AND<br><i>JUS POST BELLUM</i>        | 91         |
| A CRITIQUE OF OREND'S POSITION                                      | 94         |
| A THEOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE   | 96         |
| Conclusion  | 100        |
| <b>4. The Reconciliation Phase</b>                                  | <b>102</b> |
| Reconciliation: What It Is, What It Isn't                           | 102        |

|  |     |            |
|--|-----|------------|
| FORGIVENESS  | 103 |            |
| RECONCILIATION AND JUSTICE   | 104 |            |
| Six Elements of <i>Post Bellum</i> Reconciliation                              |     | 107        |
| IMMEDIATE POST CONFLICT PERIOD   |     | 107        |
| ACKNOWLEDGMENT   | 108 |            |
| APOLOGIES  | 110 |            |
| PUNISHMENT   | 112 |            |
| FORGIVENESS  | 113 |            |
| AMNESTY  | 115 |            |
| Conclusion   | 116 |            |
| <b>5. The Punishment Phase</b>   |     | <b>118</b> |
| Compensation   | 118 |            |
| WHAT IS POST WAR COMPENSATION, AND WHY IS IT NECESSARY?                        | 119 |            |
| WHO OUGHT TO PAY? TO WHOM IS IT OWED? WHEN SHOULD IT BE PAID?                  | 124 |            |
| HOW MUCH IS OWED AND HOW SHOULD IT BE DISTRIBUTED?                             | 129 |            |
| War Crimes Trials  | 131 |            |
| WHAT ARE WAR CRIMES? WHO IS RESPONSIBLE? WHY ARE WAR CRIMES TRIALS NECESSARY?  | 131 |            |
| WHEN AND WHERE SHOULD WAR CRIMES TRIALS BE HELD? HOW SHOULD THEY BE CONDUCTED? | 138 |            |
| Conclusion   | 139 |            |
| <b>6. The Restoration Phase</b>  |     | <b>143</b> |
| Security and Policing  | 144 |            |
| THE RULE OF LAW  | 145 |            |
| POSITIVE VERSUS NEGATIVE PEACEKEEPING  | 147 |            |
| Political Reform   | 152 |            |
| REGIME CHANGE  | 156 |            |
| REGIME CHANGE VERSUS CONTAINMENT   | 157 |            |
| POST BELLUM REGIME CHANGE  | 158 |            |
| Economic Recovery  | 160 |            |
| Social Rehabilitation  | 163 |            |
| Environmental Cleanup  | 165 |            |

**viii CONTENTS**

|                              |            |
|------------------------------|------------|
| DEPLETED URANIUM             | 166        |
| CLUSTER BOMBS AND LAND MINES | 167        |
| Conclusion                   | 172        |
| <b>Conclusion</b>            | <b>173</b> |
| <b>Notes</b>                 | <b>179</b> |
| <b>Bibliography</b>          | <b>209</b> |
| <b>Index</b>                 | <b>215</b> |