

Opera Omnia

Volume X Philosophy and Theology

Part Two

Philosophical and Theological Thought

Raimon Panikkar

Edited by Milena Carrara Pavan

ORBIS  BOOKS
Maryknoll, New York 10545

CONTENTS

Asterisks indicate the original writings of the author, the source of which is explained in the notes to the individual texts and in the specific index of the author's original texts.

<i>Abbreviations</i>	<i>xix</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>xxi</i>

SECTION I

F. H. JACOBI AND THE PHILOSOPHY OF SENTIMENT*

1

INTRODUCTION	1
1. THE PHILOSOPHY OF SENTIMENT	4
Origins	4
Historical Precedents	6
Formulation	7
2. JACOBI AGAINST PHILOSOPHY	10
The Principles	10
His Attitude	13
Jacobi's Antimony	17
3. PHILOSOPHY AGAINST JACOBI	19
Instability	19
Jacobi's Lesson	20
The Integration of Sentiment	26
<i>Definition of Philosophy</i>	26
<i>The Mission of Sentiment</i>	28
<i>Intellectual Intuition</i>	38
<i>The Positive Limit of Reason</i>	42
CONCLUSION	44
APPENDIX—CONFIDENCE: ANALYSIS OF A FEELING	46
Introduction	46
Phenomenological Description	47
<i>Initial Approach</i>	47
<i>Delimitations</i>	50

<i>Premises</i>	51
<i>Obstacles</i>	53
Anthropological Explanation	55
Metaphysical Foundation	56
<i>The Communion of Beings</i>	56
<i>The Leap to Transcendence</i>	57
<i>The Tripersonal Structure of Existence</i>	57
Theological Epilogue	58

SECTION II

FREEDOM AND CONSCIENCE*

61

1. FREEDOM	62
<i>Via Ascensionis</i>	62
<i>Via Descensionis</i>	63
2. CONSCIENCE	66
3. FREEDOM AND CONSCIENCE	69
The Place of Freedom	69
The Liberation of Conscience	69
Freedom of Conscience	70
Christian Freedom	70

SECTION III

THE ANTHROPOLOGY OF THE NEIGHBOR*

71

SECTION IV

A THEOLOGICAL MEDITATION ON AFRICA*

75

1. IS "UNCIVILIZED" CHRISTIANITY POSSIBLE?	75
2. THE RELIGIOUS CRISIS OF A CONTINENT	79
The Earthly Aspect	79
The Angelic Aspect	80
The Demoniatic Aspect	80
The Mythical Aspect	80
3. CHRISTIANITY AND THE WEST	81

SECTION V
THE EXISTENTIAL PHENOMENOLOGY OF TRUTH*

83

INTRODUCTION.....83

1. THE ASCENDING PATH86

Truth and Reality86

Truth Is God.....87

Divine Logos90

2. THE DESCENDING PATH.....96

Human Truth Is Relative.....96

Existentially96

Essentially.....99

The Negative Element of Human Truth..... 100

The Place of Error 102

Extrapolation 103

Interpolation 103

The Ineffable Existential Plurality of Truth..... 103

The Essentially Imperfect Oneness of Truth..... 105

Metaphysically..... 106

Logically 106

3. EXISTENTIAL ANALYSIS..... 108

SECTION VI
THE CONCEPT OF NATURE:
A HISTORICAL AND METAPHYSICAL ANALYSIS OF A CONCEPT*

117

INTRODUCTION..... 117

PROLOGUE TO THE SECOND EDITION 119

1. THE MEANING OF THE PROBLEM OF NATURE..... 120

Formulation 120

Signification of the Question 121

The Beginning of Philosophizing..... 122

“Modern” Philosophy..... 122

“*Deus Sive Natura*” 123

Finite Nature 125

The Meaning of Historical Evolution..... 126

The Metaphysical “Charge”..... 127

2. HISTORICAL ANALYSIS—

THE DIVERSE MEANINGS OF “NATURE” 129

Birth 129

Principle of Generation 130

God (<i>Natura Naturans</i>)	131
Intrinsic Principle of Activity	132
The Subject of All Change (Matter)	133
Form	134
Essence	135
Being (in General)	136
Substance	137
Everything Created	138
Everything Creatable	138
The Opposite of Supernatural	139
The Essence of Things, Independently from the Subsistence	139
Material Substances	139
The Spontaneous Inclination of Things: Instinct	139
Man's Thoughtless Actions	140
The Reign of Determinism: Mechanicism	140
The Sensible World	140
The Fundamental Normative Principle in the Moral Field	140
The Character of Each Being in Particular	140
3. HISTORICAL ANALYSIS—THE GESTATION OF THE CONCEPT	141
The Etymological Evolution	141
<i>Φυσις</i>	141
<i>Natura</i>	142
<i>Φυσις and Natura</i>	143
<i>The Elements</i>	144
The Problem of Nature in the Pre-Socratics	145
<i>The Method</i>	145
<i>The Change Taking Place in the World</i>	146
<i>The Cause of Change</i>	147
<i>Pre-Socratic Exegesis</i>	149
<i>The Characteristics of Φυσις</i>	151
<i>Nature and Law</i>	152
<i>The Sophistic Posture</i>	153
Nature in Classical Greek Philosophy	154
<i>Socrates</i>	154
<i>Plato</i>	155
<i>Aristotle</i>	158
The Evolution of the "Natural" in Post-Aristotelian Greek Systems	160
The Innovation Christianity Introduces in the Concept of Nature	162
<i>The Relationship between Nature and the Transcendent</i>	162
<i>The Creatuality of Nature</i>	164
<i>Contingency</i>	165
Scholastics	167
<i>Polarity in Nature</i>	167
<i>Nature from the Viewpoint of Realism</i>	168
<i>The Nominalist Posture</i>	169
<i>Augustinianism and Thomism</i>	170

	<i>The Instrumentality of Nature</i>	172
	<i>Natura Naturans and Naturata</i>	175
Later Developments		176
	<i>The Evolution of Nominalism</i>	176
	<i>Cartesian Rationalism</i>	177
	<i>The Idealist Evolution</i>	180
	<i>Nature in Idealism</i>	181
	<i>The Irrationalist Reaction</i>	182
	<i>Max Scheler and Berdyaev</i>	183
Nature in Physico-Mathematical Science.....		186
	<i>The Nature of Bodies</i>	186
	<i>The Despoliation of Substance</i>	188
	<i>The Motion of Bodies</i>	189
	<i>Scientific Spiritualism</i>	191
4. SYSTEMATIC ANALYSIS—THE ESSENTIAL TRAITS		193
	Nature as Principle	193
	Nature as Substance	195
	Nature as the Rational Structure of Reality.....	197
	Nature as Second Substance	200
5. SYSTEMATIC ANALYSIS—THE FUNDAMENTAL CONCEPT		202
	The Function of Nature	202
	Aristotelian Systematics on Act and Potency	203
	The Aristotelian Posture	204
	<i>Ενεργεια και εντελεχεια</i>	205
	The Reality of Motion	206
	The Peculiar Structure of the Mobile Being	207
	The Act of Motion.....	209
	Definition of “Nature”	210
	Nature as Activity	211
	The Dynamism of Being	213
	The Metaphysical Synthesis	215
	The Unity of Being	217
6. SYSTEMATIC ANALYSIS—PRIMARY MANIFESTATIONS		219
	Order	221
	<i>Ordo Naturae</i>	221
	<i>The Natural Ordering to God</i>	222
	<i>Perfection</i>	224
	<i>Participation</i>	224
	Love	225
	<i>Natural Inclination</i>	225
	<i>Will, Intelligence, and Love</i>	226
	<i>Plato</i>	227
	<i>Aristotle</i>	228
	<i>The Love of God</i>	229
	<i>The Love for God</i>	230

Caritas and Cupiditas 232

The Transition to the Psychological Level 234

End 235

Nature and Final Cause 235

The Aristotelian Approach 235

End, Order, and Intelligence 236

The Intentionality of Nature 238

The Potentiality of the End 239

The Idealist Interpretation 240

APPENDIX: NATURAL PROCESSES 241

The Meanings of the Adjective “Natural” 242

Dialectics of the Natural 243

 Principle of Being 243

 Principle of Becoming 243

 Passive Principle 244

 Processes by and According to Nature 244

 Natural and “Elicit” Appetite 246

 Temporal Principle 247

 Principle of Knowledge 248

The Extranatural 248

 The Antinatural 248

 The Disorderly 249

 The Sinful 249

 The Transnatural 250

SECTION VII

**PHILOSOPHY AND REVOLUTION:
THE TEXT, THE CONTEXT, AND THE TEXTURE***

1. THE TEXT 253

 Revolution 253

 Philosophy 255

2. THE CONTEXT 257

 Philosophy of Revolution 257

 The Revolution of Philosophy 257

3. THE TEXTURE 258

 Revolution as a Philosophical Theory 258

 The Idiosyncrasy of Revolution 259

SECTION VIII

**SINGULARITY AND INDIVIDUALITY:
THE DOUBLE PRINCIPLE OF INDIVIDUATION***

INTRODUCTION..... 261
 Purpose 262
 Formulation 263

1. THREE “*LOCI*” OF THE PROBLEM 264
 The Cosmological *Locus* 264
 The Epistemological *Locus*..... 265
 The Principle of Noncontradiction 265
 The Principle of Identity..... 265
 An Example 265
 The Ontological *Locus* 266
 The “Real” and the “Ideal” Factor..... 266
 Their Intrinsic Connection..... 266
 The Relationship of the Three “*Loci*” 267

2. THREE APPROACHES TO THE PROBLEM 268
 The Denial of the Principle 268
 Atomism 268
 Monism 268
 The Primacy of the Individual..... 268
 The Epistemological Approach 269
 Principium Identitatis Indiscernibilium 269
 Indiscernibility or Identity?..... 270
 Two Options 271
 The Epistemological Noncontradiction 271
 Where Does Specific Identity Lie?..... 272
 The Ontological Approach 272
 The Ontological Identity..... 272
 Where Does Numerical Identification Lie? 273

3. THE DOUBLE PRINCIPLE OF INDIVIDUATION 274
 The “Many” and the “Other” 274
 Singularity and Individuality 275
 The Two Principles 276
 The Complex Principle 277
 The Principle of Numerality 277
 The Principle of Individuality..... 277
 The Anthropological Difference..... 278
 The Ontonomic Order..... 278
 Consequences..... 279

SECTION IX

CREATION AND NOTHINGNESS*

281

CREATION: *Ex Nihilo Sed Non in Nihilum* 281

NOTHINGNESS: *Ad Quem Sed Non a Quo* 281

SECTION X

THE TEXTURE OF A TEXT:
IN RESPONSE TO PAUL RICOEUR*

289

- | | | |
|----|---|-----|
| 1. | A THESIS..... | 289 |
| 2. | THREE HERMENEUTIC MOMENTS (<i>tryarta</i>)..... | 291 |
| 3. | THE FIVE THREADS OF A TEXT (<i>pañcasūtra</i>)..... | 296 |
| | A Text Is Word Crystallized in Matter, Space, Time, and Man | 296 |
| | A Text "Says"..... | 296 |
| | A Text Says What It Means..... | 297 |
| | A Text Means Whatever Meaning Can Be Extracted from It..... | 298 |
| | The Meaning of a Text Emerges from an Ever-elusive Horizon | 299 |

SECTION XI

THE PHILOSOPHICAL TRADITION*

301

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| | INTRODUCTION..... | 301 |
| 1. | THE FOUR KAIROLOGICAL MOMENTS OF PHILOSOPHY..... | 303 |
| | The Religious | 303 |
| | The Metaphysical..... | 303 |
| | The Epistemological | 304 |
| | The Pragmatic or Historical | 304 |
| | Summing Up..... | 305 |
| 2. | THE THREEFOLD GIFT AND TASK OF PHILOSOPHY..... | 307 |
| | Acceptance of the <i>Logos</i> | 307 |
| | Taking Up the <i>Mythos</i> | 308 |
| | Reception of the <i>Pneuma</i> | 309 |
| 3. | THE ONE MYSTERY..... | 311 |

SECTION XII

ATHENS OR JERUSALEM?
PHILOSOPHY OR RELIGION?*

313

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 1. | THEME AND THESIS..... | 313 |
| 2. | THE GHOST OF THE CHRISTIAN WEST..... | 315 |
| 3. | THE FALL INTO DUALISM..... | 316 |
| 4. | WHAT HAS PHILOSOPHY TO DO WITH RELIGION? | 317 |

5. “BY THEIR FRUITS YOU WILL KNOW THEM” 319

6. PHILOSOPHY AND RELIGION 321

7. THREE ATTITUDES 323
 Heteronomy 323
 Autonomy 323
 Ontonomy 324

8. A CRITIQUE OF SOME BASIC ASSUMPTIONS 326
 The Dethronement of the *Logos* 326
 The Relativity of Belief 326
 Awareness of an Ever-provisional Standpoint 327

9. ATHENS AND/OR JERUSALEM? 328

SECTION XIII

**BEING AND NOTHINGNESS:
 INTERROGATORY PERSPECTIVE ON THE PROBLEM***

329

1. HOW DOES NOTHINGNESS COME INTO PHILOSOPHY? 330
 The Thinking Process 330
 A Matter of “Heart” 331
 The Theological Path 332
 The Philosophical Way 332
 Seeking Identity 333
 Avoiding Contradiction 336

2. A PARABLE 337

3. RETROSPECTIVE QUERY 341
 Various Thinking Styles 341
 Similar Thought Structures 341

SECTION XIV

THEOLOGY AS THEOPRAXIS*

343

1. HOW SHOULD WE SEE? A THEOLOGICAL CRITIQUE 344
 Theologically 344
 Philosophically 345
 Sociologically 346

2. WHAT DO WE SEE? A THEOLOGICAL REFLECTION 347

3. WHAT CAN WE DO? A THEOLOGICAL CONSTRUCTION 349

SECTION XV

WHAT IS COMPARATIVE PHILOSOPHY COMPARING?*

351

SECTION XVI

IDENTITY AND NONCONTRADICTION:
TWO SCHEMES OF INTELLIGIBILITY*

361

SECTION XVII

THINKING AND BEING*

369

SECTION XVIII

THE EXPERIENTIAL "ARGUMENT" OF ABHINAVAGUPTA:
A CROSS-CULTURAL CONSIDERATION*

373

- | | | |
|----|--|-----|
| 1. | THE PROBLEM: THE HOW | 373 |
| | Introduction | 373 |
| | The Context | 375 |
| | An Exegetical Nonary | 380 |
| 2. | THE TEXT: THE WHAT | 383 |
| | Abhinavagupta's Text | 383 |
| | Anselm's Text | 387 |
| | The Homeomorphic Equivalent | 388 |
| 3. | A CROSS-CULTURAL COMMENTARY: THE WHY | 390 |
| | Better Understanding and Critique: Osmosis | 390 |
| | Mutual Fecundation: Symbiosis | 392 |
| | Irreducible Attitudes: Pluralism | 395 |

SECTION XIX

CAN THEOLOGY BE TRANSCULTURAL?*

399

- | | | |
|----|--------------------------------|-----|
| 1. | THE SUPRACULTURAL CLAIM | 402 |
| 2. | THE SUPERCULTURAL CLAIM | 405 |
| 3. | THE CROSS-CULTURAL CLAIM | 408 |

SECTION XX

**PHILOSOPHY AND THEOLOGY: AN OUTDATED DISTINCTION
NOTES FOR DISCUSSION***

415

- 1. PHILOSOPHY AND THEOLOGY—REASON AND FAITH..... 419
- 2. THE CONTEMPORARY OVERCOMING..... 423

SECTION XXI

MAN, THE MEDIEVAL BEING*

425

- 1. MAN: THE “MIDDLE AGE” 425
 - Theocentrism of a Historic God 425
 - The Age Linking Us to Antiquity and Modernity..... 426
- 2. MAN: THE THIRD WORLD 428
 - What Is the Self-understanding of Medieval Man?..... 428
 - Anthropology and Gnothi Seauton*..... 428
 - Quaestio Mihi Factus Sum*..... 429
 - Tertius Mundus: Intra Deum et Nihil* 430
 - Why Do We Need to Understand Medieval Man? 432
 - To Understand Ourselves* 432
 - To Safeguard Our Humanness* 433
 - To Reach Human Maturity*..... 434
 - How Should We Understand Medieval Man Today?..... 435
- 3. MAN AS “MESOCOSM” 438
 - Symbolic Thinking 438
 - Medium saeculum: Meta ta aiona*..... 438
 - The Missing Link..... 439

SECTION XXII

RELIGION, PHILOSOPHY, AND CULTURE*

411

- INTRODUCTION..... 442
- 1. PHILOSOPHY 444
 - What Are We Talking About? 444
 - Homeomorphic Equivalents..... 444
 - What It Is that We Are Talking About..... 446
- 2. CULTURE..... 449
 - The Encompassing Myth..... 449

Nature and Culture..... 451
 Interculturality..... 452
 3. “PROBLEMATIQUE”..... 456
 The Transformative Function of Philosophy..... 456
 Interculturalization..... 457
 Mythos and *Logos*..... 460

**SECTION XXIII
 THE PROBLEM OF EVIL***

463

1. AN UNDENIABLE FACT..... 464
 2. AN INCOMPREHENSIBLE HUMAN FACT..... 466
 3. HOW TO DEAL WITH EVIL..... 470

**SECTION XXIV
 DEATH AND RESURRECTION OF THEOLOGY***

473

**SECTION XXV
 MEMORIES OF MARTIN HEIDEGGER:
 AN UNFINISHED SYMPHONY***

485

Bibliography..... 491
Glossary..... 503
Index of Original Texts in this Volume..... 511
Index of Names..... 513
About the Author..... 518