

ABUSE AND COVER-UP

*Refounding the Catholic Church
in Trauma*

Gerald A. Arbuckle, SM

ORBIS  BOOKS
Maryknoll, New York 10545


ORBIS BOOKS
Maryknoll, New York 10545

 Fathers and Brothers
MARYKNOLL™

Founded in 1970, Orbis Books endeavors to publish works that enlighten the mind, nourish the spirit, and challenge the conscience. The publishing arm of the Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers, Orbis seeks to explore the global dimensions of the Christian faith and mission, to invite dialogue with diverse cultures and religious traditions, and to serve the cause of reconciliation and peace. The books published reflect the views of their authors and do not represent the official position of the Maryknoll Society. To learn more about Maryknoll and Orbis Books, please visit our website at www.maryknollsociety.org.

Copyright © 2019 by Gerald A. Arbuckle

Published by Orbis Books, Box 302, Maryknoll, NY 10545-0302.

All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

Except where noted, all scripture quotations are from the New Revised Standard Version of the Bible, copyright © 1989 by the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the USA. All rights reserved.

Queries regarding rights and permissions should be addressed to: Orbis Books, P.O. Box 302, Maryknoll, NY 10545-0302.

Manufactured in the United States of America

Names: Arbuckle, Gerald A., author.

Title: Abuse and cover-up : refounding the Catholic Church in trauma / Gerald A. Arbuckle.

Description: Maryknoll : Orbis Books, 2019. | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2019008951 (print) | LCCN 2019019679 (ebook) | ISBN 9781608338030 (e-book) | ISBN 9781626983397 (print)

Subjects: LCSH: Child sexual abuse by clergy. | Catholic Church—Clergy—Sexual behavior. | Catholic Church—Discipline. | Catholic Church—History—21st century.

Classification: LCC BX1912.9 (ebook) | LCC BX1912.9 .A73 2019 (print) | DDC 282.09/051—dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2019008951>

Contents

<i>Acknowledgments</i>	<i>xiii</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>xv</i>
Rhetoric over Reality	<i>xvii</i>
Cultures of Abuse and Cover-Up	<i>xviii</i>
Refounding the Church	<i>xxi</i>
Overview of the Book	<i>xxii</i>
1. Covering Up Power Abuse: Cultural Dynamics	1
Cultural Cover-Ups	3
Church Cover-Ups	4
Cultural Resistance (Axiom 1)	5
Symbols (Axiom 2)	9
Myths Cement Culture (Axiom 3)	11
Structures and Myths	14
Residual Myths and Cover-Ups	15
Myths and History	15
Manipulation of Myths (Axiom 4)	17
Culture and Power (Axiom 5)	20
Clericalism and Power	21
Abuse of Authority	24
Coercive Power in Toxic Cultures (Axiom 6)	26
Cultural Change and Grief (Axiom 7)	29
Cultures and Social Systems (Axiom 8)	30
Types of Culture Change (Axiom 9)	32
Culture, Corruption, Cover-Ups, and Shame (Axiom 10)	35
Systemic Cover-Up Culture in the Church (Axiom 11)	37
Fear and Shame Motivate Cover-Ups (Axiom 12)	40

Uncovering Sexual Abuse Scandals (Axiom 13)	42
The Role of Whistleblowers (Axiom 14)	44
Moral Panics (Axiom 15)	45
Summary	47
2. Why Is the Church Prone to Cultural Cover-Ups?	49
Clericalism Defined	50
Brief Overview of Global Systemic Patterns	52
United States	52
Canada	54
Ireland	55
England	55
Australia	57
Chile	59
Cultural Models	60
Cultural Models of the Church	61
Model 1: Strong Group/Strong Grid Culture— Pre-Vatican II Church	64
Anthropological Analysis	64
Application to Pre-Vatican II Church	71
Model 2: Weak Group/Weak Grid Culture— Vatican II Church	84
Anthropological Analysis	84
Application to Vatican II Church	86
Model 3: Strong Group/Weak Grid Culture— Restorationist Church	88
Anthropological Analysis	88
Application to Restorationist Church	89
Summary	93
3. The Grieving Church in Focus	95
Models of Cultural Change	97
Management Insights	97
Anthropological Insights	99
Grief-Overload Model	102
Theoretical Background	102
Stages of Grief Overload	103

Grief-Overload Model Application to the Church	109
Historical Background	109
Stages of Grief Overload in the Church	111
Stage 1: Cultural Consensus—Pre-Vatican II	111
Stage 2: Consensus Threatened—Initial Unease (1965-67+)	111
Stage 3: Political Reactions—Chaos (1967+)	113
Stage 4: Grief Overload—Cultural Trauma (1990+)	114
Stage 5: Impasse Options (2000+)	116
Summary	116
4. Leadership for Refounding the Church	118
Servant Leadership	119
Leadership Styles	124
Refounding Movements	126
Refounding People	130
Refounding the Church	134
Qualities of Refounding Leaders	136
Contemplation in Action	136
Prophetic Boldness	138
Innovation	139
Sense of Humor	141
Creative Imagination	142
Gift of Lamentation	143
Discernment	144
Concluding Options	145
Summary	147
5. Structural Reform in the Church	149
Three Levels of Church Governance in Need of Reform	150
Lay Involvement in Governance Reform	153
New Forms of Lay Ministry	155
Historical Basis for Lay Involvement	157
Contemporary Lessons	160
Laicization of Ministries: Three Challenges	161
Summary	162

6. Refounding the Church: Action Plans and Strategies	164
Call to Hierarchies: Conversion (Action Plan 1)	169
Explanation	169
Strategies for Conversion	170
Acknowledging Chaos/Trauma (Action Plan 2)	171
Explanation	171
Strategies for Acknowledging Chaos/Trauma	174
Solidarity: Collective Mourning and Penance (Action Plan 3)	175
Explanation	175
Strategies for Collective Mourning and Penance	177
Reacting to Shame (Action Plan 4)	178
Explanation	178
Strategies for Reacting to Shame	179
Becoming a Pilgrim Church (Action Plan 5)	180
Explanation	180
Strategies for Becoming a Pilgrim Church	182
Evaluating Ministries According to the Mission of Jesus Christ (Action Plan 6)	183
Explanation	183
Strategies for Evaluating Ministries	184
Accountability Structures for Leaders (Action Plan 7)	185
Explanation	185
Urgency	186
Defining Accountability	187
Clarifying Roles	188
Strategies for Developing an Accountability Culture	189
Development of Collaborative Leadership (Action Plan 8)	190
Explanation	191
Strategies for Developing Collaborative Leadership	191
Intentional Faith Communities as Culture Changers (Action Plan 9)	192
Explanation	192
Strategies for Developing Intentional Faith Communities	194

CONTENTS

xi

Fostering Popular Piety (Action Plan 10)	195
Explanation	195
Strategies for Fostering Popular Piety	196
Storytelling and Refounding (Action Plan 11)	197
Explanation	197
Strategies for Storytelling	199
Formation of Priests (Action Plan 12)	199
Explanation	200
Strategies for the Selection and Training of Priests	202
Lay Formation (Action Plan 13)	203
Explanation	203
Strategies for Lay Ministries	204
Evaluating Pastoral Care (Action Plan 14)	205
Explanation	205
Strategies for Evaluating Pastoral Care	207
Pastoral Care of Survivors (Action Plan 15)	207
Explanation	207
Strategies for Pastoral Care of Survivors	208
Summary	210
<i>Index</i>	213