

# Opera Omnia

## Volume VII Hinduism and Christianity

Raimon Panikkar

Edited by Milena Carrara Pavan

ORBIS  BOOKS  
Maryknoll, New York 10545

Founded in 1970, Orbis Books endeavors to publish works that enlighten the mind, nourish the spirit, and challenge the conscience. The publishing arm of the Maryknoll Fathers and Brothers, Orbis seeks to explore the global dimensions of the Christian faith and mission, to invite dialogue with diverse cultures and religious traditions, and to serve the cause of reconciliation and peace. The books published reflect the views of their authors and do not represent the official position of the Maryknoll Society. To learn more about Maryknoll and Orbis Books, please visit our website at [www.maryknollsociety.org](http://www.maryknollsociety.org).

---

Copyright © 2006 by *Fundació Vivarium Raimon Panikkar*, Tavertet  
International Copyright handled by *Editoriale Jaca Book SpA*, Milan

English edition, copyright © 2019 by Orbis Books,  
Maryknoll, New York 10545-0302.  
Manufactured in the United States of America.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or any information storage or retrieval system, without prior permission in writing from the publisher.

Queries regarding rights and permissions should be addressed to: Orbis Books, P.O. Box 302, Maryknoll, New York 10545-0302.

---

#### Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Panikkar, Raimon, 1918–2010, author. | Carrara Pavan, Milena, editor.

Title: Hinduism and Christianity / Raimon

Panikkar ; edited by Milena Carrara Pavan.

Description: Maryknoll : Orbis Books, 2019. | Series: Opera omnia ; Volume VII | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018056201 (print) | LCCN 2019009552 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781608337880 (paper) | ISBN 9781626983274 (cloth)

Subjects: LCSH: Christianity and other religions—Hinduism. |

Hinduism—Relations—Christianity.

Classification: LCC BR128.H5 (ebook) | LCC BR128.H5 P23 2019 (print) |

DDC 261.2/45--dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018056201>

# CONTENTS

*Abbreviations* ..... xiii

## INTRODUCTION

THE NEW PROBLEM ..... xvii  
AN OFTEN-OVERLOOKED METHODOLOGICAL OBSERVATION..... xviii  
CHRISTIANITY AND HINDUISM ..... xx  
    *The Theological Issue* ..... xx  
    *The Hermeneutical Issue* ..... xxii  
    *The Philosophical Problem* ..... xxiv

## SECTION I: THE UNKNOWN CHRIST OF HINDUISM

*The Unknown Christ of Hinduism and the Semina Verbi, by Julien Ries* ..... 3  
*Preface to the 2007 Edition* ..... 6  
*Prologue* ..... 8  
*Preface to the 1979 Edition* ..... 11

### Introduction

1. *TRADITUM*: THE LEGACY OF THE PAST ..... 15  
2. *TRADENDUM*: THE CHALLENGE OF THE PRESENT ..... 28

### Part One: The Encounter

1. THE SEARCH FOR COMMON GROUND ..... 37  
2. CHRIST, THE POINT OF ENCOUNTER ..... 42  
3. INSUFFICIENCY OF PURELY DOCTRINAL PARALLELISMS ..... 46  
4. INADEQUACY OF CULTURAL SYNTHESSES ..... 48  
5. THE EXISTENTIAL ENCOUNTER ..... 50  
6. THE HINDŪ BASIS OF THE ENCOUNTER ..... 52  
7. THE CHRISTIAN BASIS OF THE ENCOUNTER ..... 54  
8. CHRIST, A CONCRETE SYMBOL ..... 56  
9. THE ENCOUNTER IN THE SPIRIT ..... 61

### Part Two: Hinduism and Christianity

1. STATUS QUAECTIONIS ..... 67  
    *An Ecumenical Problem*  
    The “And” of the Relationship ..... 70  
2. INITIAL APPROACHES ..... 72  
3. SIN AND SANCTITY; ERROR AND TRUTH ..... 74  
4. THE NATURAL AND THE SUPERNATURAL ..... 75

5.	INADEQUACIES OF THE SUPERIORITY APPROACH.....	77
	Psychological and Pastoral Inadequacy .....	77
	Historical Experience .....	79
	Theological Reflection .....	81
6.	POWER AND ACTION .....	87

### **Part Three: God and the World according to the *Brahma Sūtra* I.1.2**

1.	PRELIMINARY OBSERVATIONS.....	93
	A Philosophical Dialogue .....	93
	The God of Our Study .....	96
2.	THE TEXT .....	99
	Background.....	99
	Analysis .....	100
	Importance of the Text.....	101
3.	ŚANKARA'S INTERPRETATION .....	103
4.	THE <i>SŪTRA</i> IN ITS CONTEXT .....	106
5.	THE BRIDGE TOWARD TRANSCENDENCE .....	108
	The <i>Jñāna</i> of <i>Jijñāsa</i> .....	108
	<i>Jñāna</i> : Knowledge of the Contingent.....	110
	<i>Jijñāsa</i> : The Desire for Knowledge .....	111
	Rational and Natural Knowledge .....	112
6.	THE COSMOLOGICAL ARGUMENT .....	116
	From the World to Its Cause.....	118
	<i>Our Knowledge of the World</i> .....	118
	<i>The World of Our Knowledge</i> .....	118
	From the Cause to Brahman .....	119
	<i>Excursus on Brahman</i> .....	119
	<i>The Final Stage of the Discussion</i> .....	125
7.	ADVAITA AND TRINITY .....	128
	The Problem of <i>Īśvara</i> .....	128
	Christological Comment.....	132
	Epilogue .....	137
	Bibliography.....	143

## **SECTION II: A CONFRONTATION BETWEEN HINDUISM AND CHRISTIANITY**

### **Part One: The Integration of Indic Philosophical and Religious Thought into Christian Theology**

1.	THE PROBLEM .....	175
2.	THE IDEA OF INTEGRATION .....	176
3.	THE CONDITIONS FOR INTEGRATION.....	178
	The Understanding of Christian Theology .....	178
	A Theological Understanding of Indic Philosophy .....	178
4.	PRINCIPLES OF INTEGRATION .....	180
	Principle of Homogeneity.....	180

Principle of Profundity . . . . .	180
Principle of Tradition . . . . .	181
<b>Part Two: The Mystery of Worship in Hinduism and Christianity</b>	
Foreword . . . . .	185
INTRODUCTION . . . . .	186
The Importance of This Question for Christianity Today . . . . .	186
<i>The Absolute Claims of Christianity—A Scandal</i> . . . . .	187
<i>Ecumenical Perspective</i> . . . . .	188
<i>Western Cultural Thinking</i> . . . . .	192
The Importance of This Question for India Today . . . . .	196
1. GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE HINDŪ CONCEPT	
OF REALITY . . . . .	198
The Vision of the All . . . . .	198
Hierarchical Structure of the All . . . . .	200
The Primacy of Worship . . . . .	201
Comparative Survey of the Two Cultures . . . . .	203
<i>The Sphere of Ontology</i> . . . . .	203
<i>The Sphere of Anthropology</i> . . . . .	204
<i>The Sphere of Sociology</i> . . . . .	205
2. WORSHIP AND TIME . . . . .	207
Worship Is Action . . . . .	207
Time Is the Basis of All Action . . . . .	209
Time Both Springs from and Dies through Worship . . . . .	209
<i>God and Time</i> . . . . .	211
<i>Man and Time</i> . . . . .	212
3. THE THREE PHASES OF HINDŪ WORSHIP . . . . .	214
The Vedas and the <i>Brāhmaṇas</i> — <i>Karma-mārga</i> . . . . .	214
The Upanishads and “Modern” Evolution— <i>Jñāna-mārga</i> . . . . .	218
<i>The Sacrifice of the Intellect</i> . . . . .	220
<i>Pure Contemplation</i> . . . . .	222
<i>Secularized Knowledge</i> . . . . .	224
Ways of Salvation and Hindū Devotion— <i>Bhakti-mārga</i> . . . . .	225
Anthropological Perspective . . . . .	227
<i>Heteronomy</i> . . . . .	229
<i>Autonomy</i> . . . . .	230
<i>Ontonomy</i> . . . . .	232
4. PRINCIPAL FORMS OF WORSHIP . . . . .	234
Sacrifice . . . . .	234
<i>The Puruṣa</i> . . . . .	235
<i>Prajāpati-Puruṣa</i> . . . . .	236
<i>Prajāpati and the Logos</i> . . . . .	238
<i>Agni, the Fire</i> . . . . .	239
Prayer . . . . .	241
<i>Salvation through Prayer</i> . . . . .	242
<i>Salvation in Prayer</i> . . . . .	244
Adoration . . . . .	244

Brief Cosmological Survey .....	246
<i>The Sacrifice of the Cosmos</i> .....	247
Space .....	248
Time .....	249
Things .....	250
<i>The Sacrifice of Man</i> .....	251
Rites and Ritual .....	252
Inner Intention .....	253
Plenitude in Worship .....	254
5. WORSHIP IN HINDUISM AND CHRISTIANITY .....	256
The Meaning of Worship in Hinduism .....	256
<i>Methodology</i> .....	256
Translation .....	256
Conversion .....	258
<i>An Example: The Symbol</i> .....	260
The Symbolic Character of Beings .....	261
Hellenistic and Hindū Formulations .....	263
The Broken Jar .....	266
Application to Sacrifice .....	273
Supplement .....	276
Relevance for Contemporary Christianity .....	277
<i>The Liturgy: A Movement toward Wholeness</i> .....	280
<i>Orthopraxy and Orthodoxy</i> .....	285
<i>Dhyāna-mārga</i> .....	291
Transmythization .....	293
<i>Demythization</i> .....	293
<i>Logos</i> .....	294
<i>Mythos</i> .....	297
<i>Parable</i> .....	301
<i>Remythization</i> .....	304
Remythization of the Christian Message .....	307
Remythization of Hinduism .....	311
Final Consideration .....	314

### **Part Three: The Problem of Justice in Hindū-Christian Dialogue**

1. METHODOLOGY .....	319
The Violence of Questions .....	319
The Limits of Questions .....	320
The Inevitability of Questions .....	320
2. THE HINDŪ WORLD .....	322
Hinduism Has No Essence .....	322
Hinduism Is an Existence .....	322
Hinduism and Justice .....	323
3. THE CONTRIBUTION TO DIALOGUE .....	328
Is There a Christian Justice? .....	328
Contribution of Intrareligious Dialogue to the Contemporary World .....	330
The Last Dilemma .....	331

### Part Four: A Confrontation between Hinduism and Christ

1. HINDUISM'S ENCOUNTER WITH CHRIST ..... 335
  - The Misunderstanding ..... 335
  - The Meeting Is Ambiguous from the Start ..... 336
    - A Suffering God* ..... 337
    - A Divine Man* ..... 337
    - A Human God* ..... 337
2. CHRIST'S ENCOUNTER WITH HINDUISM ..... 339
  - Extrapolation ..... 339
  - The Specifically Christian Characteristics of the Act of Faith ..... 340
  - The Challenge ..... 341

### Part Five: *Ekklēsia* and *Mandiram*, Two Symbols of Human Spirituality

1. OUR SITUATION ..... 345
2. THE HINDŪ AND THE CHRISTIAN QUEST ..... 347
  - The Two Temples and the One People ..... 347
  - Trimārga* and *Homo Viator* ..... 348
  - Upāyānupāya*: "Ya por aquí no (h)ay camino" ..... 349

### Part Six: The Distorted Face of the Church in India— God of the Poor and the Poor of God

### Part Seven: An Indic-Christian Theology of Religious Pluralism in the Perspective of Interculturation

1. DEFINITIONS ..... 361
  - Indic ..... 361
  - Christian ..... 361
  - Christian Faith ..... 362
  - Theology ..... 362
  - Religion ..... 362
  - Pluralism ..... 363
  - Culture ..... 364
  - Cultural Change ..... 366
  - An Indic-Christian Theology of Religious Pluralism in the  
Perspective of Interculturation ..... 369
2. NINE *SŪTRAS* ..... 370
  1. Religion Is the Soul of Culture ..... 370
  2. Culture Is the Body of Religion ..... 370
  3. Culture and Religion Share an Advaitic relationship ..... 371
  4. Inculturation Is Not a Religiously Neutral Act ..... 371
  5. Inculturation Was Justified by the Modern Christian Belief That the  
Christic Fact Is Supernatural and Thus Supracultural ..... 372
  6. Today, Both Myths—Christianity's Religious Superiority and the  
Church's Cultural Immunity—Are in Crisis ..... 373
  7. A Conscious Inculturation Demands a Reinterpretation of the Religions  
Involved in the Process ..... 375

8. A *Kenōtic* Christ and a Śūnyavāda May Provide a Theological Starting Point for a Hindū-Christian Interculturation . . . . . 378
9. The Liberation of Man Is the Guiding Principle of Interculturation . . . . . 379

### **Part Eight: The Dream of an Indian Ecclesiology**

1. THEOLOGICAL PREMISES . . . . . 385
  - An Indian Theological and Ecclesiological Reflection *Ab Ovo*
    - Is Legitimate and Imperative . . . . . 385
  - The Christian Community Faces a Radically New Situation after Twenty Centuries of Existence; The Signs of Mutation Are Recognizable . . . . . 386
  - There Is an Existential Gap between Dogmatic Theology and Ecclesiology; It Is the Abyss between Theory and Praxis . . . . . 387
2. ECCLESIOLOGICAL REFLECTIONS . . . . . 389
  - The Concept of Church Entails the Harmonious Combination of Sacrament, Hierarchy, and People . . . . . 389
  - The Main Ecclesiological Problem Today Lies in Hierarchy (Church II) . . . . . 391
  - The Two Major Events in Ecclesiology Are the Radical Changes Both in the Consciousness of the Mystery (Church I) and of the People (Church III) . . . . . 391
3. THE INDIAN SITUATION . . . . . 393
  - The Church in India Has Undergone the Unnatural Experience of Inheriting an Organization, Accepting an Institution, and from There Striving to Convert Itself into an Organism . . . . . 393
  - A Living Church in India Would Be the Fruit of the Reenactment of the Transtemporal Mystery of Incarnation: A Fecundation between the Spirit and the Indian Matrix . . . . . 394
  - The Church in India May Immediately Build Its Own Identity in Two Fields: The Religious and the Social . . . . . 395
    - The Religious Field* . . . . . 395
    - The Social Field* . . . . . 396

### **Part Nine: Indic Theology: A Theological Mutation**

1. INTRODUCTION: "THEOLOGY IS NOT IN BONDAGE" . . . . . 407
2. THEOLOGY IN INDIA . . . . . 408
3. THE PROBLEM OF AN INDIC THEOLOGY . . . . . 412
  - Theology and History . . . . . 412
  - Theology and *Logos* . . . . . 414
  - Theology and *Theos* . . . . . 415
  - Vāc* and *Logos* . . . . . 417
  - Appendix: The *Theos* and the Spirit . . . . . 419
- Glossary* . . . . . 421
- Index of Original Texts in This Volume* . . . . . 429
- Index of Names* . . . . . 431
- About the Author* . . . . . 436